

Scottish Catholic Historical Association

A word from the Convener

Inside this Issue

- 1 Word from the Convener
- 2 News
- 3 Dates for your diary
- 4 Conference paper summaries
- 5 The Innes Review & new publications

The 2013 Seminar series:

Wed, 27 February 2013:

'Sectarianism in Suburbia: John Cormack & the Morningside Riot of 1935'. (Dr. David Ritchie, University of Edinburgh)

Wed, 27 March 2013:

The churches, chapels and tombs of the first Scottish Architect, Mr James Smith of Whitehill (c1645-1731) (Dr. Cristina Gonzalez-Longo, University of Edinburgh)

Wed, 24 April 2013:

The Architecture of Three Religions': church building in Scotland, 1580-1640 (Prof. Charles McKean, University of Dundee).

The seminars will begin at 5.30pm in the Chapter Room in St Mary's Cathedral House, 63 York Place, Edinburgh.

It gives me great pleasure to be writing this note as a foreword to the SCHA Newsletter, the first since I became Convener of the SCHA. It is an extremely welcome development that our Newsletter is returning, and we owe this to the hard work and good offices of our recently appointed Development Officer, Darren Tierney. Darren has also organised the re-instated Seminar series which begins this month, and was a major force in the success of our autumn conference, and the Council is immensely grateful to him.

It has been an eventful year or so, and some of the eventfulness lies behind the hiatus in the publication of the Newsletter and our Seminar series. As most of our members will know, the SCHA has been involved over the past year in the controversy over the proposed split of the Scottish Catholic Archives, the removal on loan of much of the material from before 1878 to Aberdeen (along with books of the Blairs College Library, currently held in the National Library of Scotland), and the as yet undetermined fate of the bulk of the Archives. We have maintained the view that the Archives should remain together, and remain in their current proximity to other national collections, a view shared with Scotland's other main professional historical societies, and many others furth of Scotland.

At the present time, however, the situation, as far as we understand it, is as follows: a loan agreement for the transfer of a large number of the pre-1878 Archives to Aberdeen University Library has been signed by the Trustees of the Scottish Catholic Heritage Collections Trust and the University of Aberdeen. Arrangements for the actual move are not finalised, and material for the present remains in Columba House. The list of Archives to be loaned to Aberdeen exists, but has not to date been made publicly available to researchers. There is still no clear statement of what is to happen to the remainder of the Archives. For the present, researchers can still visit Columba House to do research, though in much restricted circumstances, by appointment. The Archives are currently under the care of the Glasgow Archdiocesan archivist, Dr Mary McHugh. We will continue to monitor the situation, to press our views with the Trustees and the Bishops' Conference, and to maintain our keen interest in the well being of the Archives. We will update you in future Newsletters.

It must be a cause of great regret among all those interested in Scottish Catholic history that Andrew Nicoll is no longer the Keeper of the Scottish Catholic Archives. He was greatly praised by fellow archivists and all who worked with the archives in Columba House, and I would like to pay tribute here to his hard work in the post. I am very grateful that he continues his relationship with the SCHA, remaining on as our Treasurer.

As we report inside, there has been a change of editors for our journal, *The Innes Review*. On behalf of the Council, and I am sure all our members, I would like to thank Dr Eila Williamson for all her hard work, and welcome Dr John Reuben Davies as the new editor.

We hope to see you at Seminars, at some of the other events we call your attention to, and at our annual conference.

Professor Thomas Owen Clancy, Convener, The Scottish Catholic Historical Association.

News

Our 2012 conference, 'Thomas Innes (1662-1744): His World and His Legacy', held at the University of Glasgow, was a great success. We were particularly pleased to offer four postgraduate conference bursaries to students from the universities of Edinburgh, Glasgow and Aberdeen, and hope to continue such support in the future. A summary of proceedings can be found in section three. Thank you to all our presenters and to all of you who attended. Details of this year's conference will be sent out in due course. Our seminar series for this year has now been confirmed (see left on first page) and will take place in St Mary's Cathedral House, Edinburgh. Please note the change of venue. We would like to express our thanks to Mgr. Regan for kindly agreeing to host us.

For any questions or more information, please contact me at dtierney85@gmail.com. Darren Tierney, Development Officer.

New Editor of *The Innes Review*

Dr Eila Williamson is stepping down as Editor of *The Innes Review* and as a council member after many years of service. We would like to thank Eila for all her hard work and wish her well for the future. Dr John Reuben Davies has now taken up the editorship. John Reuben Davies was born in Bangor, North Wales. He is a graduate of the University of Durham (Theology) and the University of Cambridge (Anglo-Saxon, Norse, and Celtic); he has been a Research Fellow in Scottish History at the University of Edinburgh (2004-2007), and since 2008 has been a Research Associate in Scottish History at the University of Glasgow. He has published a number of essays and articles on the cult of saints and the ecclesiastical history of Britain in the early and central middle ages. He is the author of *The Book of Llandaf and the Norman Church in Wales* (2003), is co-editor of *Saints' Cults in the Celtic World* (2009), and co-author of the electronic resources, *Database of Dedications to Saints in Medieval Scotland* (available at <http://www.shca.ed.ac.uk/Research/saints/>), and *People of Medieval Scotland* (www.poms.ac.uk). Dr Davies regularly leads the Daily Service in Glasgow University Chapel, and serves on the Liturgy Committee of the Scottish Episcopal Church.

Gift Aid

Members are reminded that, as with many other charities, the Scottish Catholic Historical Association qualifies for the Gift Aid scheme and we commend it to you as a way in which the Association might increase the funds available to it to further our aims. If you are a UK taxpayer, please read the guidance on the form provided in the last mailing carefully and if appropriate to you, please return to the address below. Further guidance on Gift Aid can be found on the HMRC website – www.hmrc.gov.uk

We have the opportunity to reclaim Gift Aid contributions for the past four years. If you have been a member within this time and Gift Aid is appropriate, please tick the appropriate boxes. Our membership records will provide us with enough information for us to process this from any time in the last four years. Please also use this form to indicate that we can claim Gift Aid on any future gifts (including membership through subscription to the *Innes Review* with Edinburgh University Press). Please note the correspondence address for the Treasurer is now: Treasurer, Scottish Catholic Historical Association, 8/1 Boat Green, Edinburgh EH3 5LL.

Dates of interest for your Diary

Scottish Church History Society:

27 March 2013: **Anti-Catholic Riots in Glasgow and Edinburgh 1778-79** (Dr Michael Turnbull).

8 May 2013: **Modes of Gendered Scottish Missionary Acculturation in Earl 20th Century Palestine** (Dr Michael Marten, University of Stirling)

19 February, 2013: **Hospitality and the Church in the Highlands in the medieval and early modern eras.** (Dr Iain MacDonald, University of Glasgow). This meeting will take place in 3 University Gardens, Glasgow, at 5.30pm (in association with the Centre for Scottish and Celtic Studies, University of Glasgow)

All meetings except for February will convene at the Free Church College, The Mound, Edinburgh at 2.30pm

Glasgow Newman Association:

28 February 2013: **The Angry Church: Catholic Conservatives and Liberals** (Prof Gerard Carruthers, University of Glasgow).

14 March 2013: **The Vatican and the American Sisters' Leadership Group** (Sr Mary Ross, Sisters of Notre Dame).

25 April 2013: **Cardinal Carlo Martini: a Prophet for Our Times** (Fr Jim Lawlor, Immaculate Conception Church, Glasgow).

All talks will take place in Turnbull Hall, Glasgow University's Catholic Chaplaincy, at 7.30pm.

Conference 2012 proceedings

The 21st annual SCHA Conference was held at the University of Glasgow on 10th November 2012. The following summaries will hopefully be of interest to those members who were unable to attend.

Monsignor Brian Halloran, Archdiocese of St Andrew's and Edinburgh: ***The Life of Thomas Innes:***

Monsignor Halloran, author of the Scots College Paris, 1603-1792, opened the conference with a lively paper on the life of Thomas Innes. Mgr. Halloran explored various aspects of Innes's life including his ecclesiastical studies, priestly work in Paris and labours on the Scottish Mission. In 1701, Innes was appointment agent for the mission and sent back to the Scots College, Paris where he was prefect of studies between 1704 and 1712 and 1718 and 1727. Mgr. Halloran also considered Innes's scholarly work, his ties with the House of Stuart and links with the Jansenist movement, all of which set the context and tone for the remainder of the conference.

Prof. Colin Kidd, University of St Andrews: ***The World of Thomas Innes:***

This paper attempted to set Innes's achievements in the wider context of British and French scholarship of the late seventeenth and early eighteenth century. It moved beyond the familiar connection with Mabillon's pioneering diplomatic methods to explore developments and debates about classical antiquity in the era of what is sometimes called 'The Quarrel of the Ancients and the Moderns' or 'The Battle of the Books'. This controversy, which spilled over from late seventeenth-century France into England, involved several theatres of debate, one of which centred on the authenticity of the Epistles of Phalaris, the tyrant of Agrigentum in the sixth century BC. Richard Bentley (1662-1742) deployed a range of sophisticated investigative methods to show that the Epistles of Phalaris, much celebrated by champions of the Ancients, were in fact forgeries, most probably literary exercises from a later period of antiquity. However, it transpired that the emergence of new critical methods was not a straightforward story of progress. Scepticism about the authenticity of ancient works could sometimes lead to bizarre results, as in the case of the French Jesuit, Jean Hardouin (1646-1729), who argued that the entire canon of classical literature - with the exception of a few works by Cicero, Horace and Pliny - had been fabricated in the middle ages.

Dr. Karin Bowie, University of Glasgow: ***Thomas Innes and the Limitations Debate in late Stuart Scotland:***

This paper placed the historical work of Father Thomas Innes into his immediate political context, showing how he responded to contemporary debates on the nature of the Scottish monarchy. While acknowledging Innes' celebrated documentary scholarship, it showed how Innes sought to prove that the Scottish monarchy had been created by Fergus I and God alone and had remained an unlimited monarchy until the dastardly histories of Boece and Buchanan began to promulgate the myth of an elective Scottish crown. Innes' *Critical Essay* of 1729 was firmly rooted in the historical polemic of his lifetime: it responded to Presbyterian pamphleteers who argued for contractual monarchy during the Restoration and post-Revolution periods and drew on royalist Episcopalian authors like Gilbert Burnet to support historical arguments for the unconditional rule of the Stuart line. With his *Essay*, Innes aimed not just to tidy up the ancient Scottish king-lists, but provide historical foundations for the constitutional contours of a restored Stuart monarchy.

Dr. James Fraser, University of Edinburgh: ***"Reforming our vulgar historians": legacies and lessons of Innes's Essay for Dark Age Studies today:***

At the dawn of the eighteenth century, the authoritative text on early Scottish history was generally held to be George Buchanan's *Rerum Scoticana historia* (1582), whose information about the period was derived and adapted from Hector Boece's *Scotorum historia* (1527). In his *Critical Essay*, Thomas Innes demonstrated that this Boece-Buchanan tradition was a spurious mix of inventions of later ages. His guiding principle, that ancient accounts of history are due no more credit than what is due to their vouchers, still guides today's researchers, who seek to identify good evidence and to draw reasonable inferences from it. Innes's decisions about what was (and was not) good evidence set the study of early Scottish history on a new footing, and his Appendix of transcriptions of particularly valuable texts and documents paved the way for the great source collections eventually published by Skene and Anderson. As subsequent generations of scholars refined his critical method, not all of Innes's decisions stood the test of time; and in the second half of the twentieth century, as Dark Age Studies became increasingly concerned with the co-ordination of textual, archaeological and linguistic evidence, Innes's text-based understanding of the past was left behind. Yet what is striking about the *Critical Essay* is not how old-fashioned it appears nowadays, but how many of Innes's observations on his textual sources chime with recent findings by scholars who have rather lost sight of Innes's work. Perhaps his thinking on the subject of the origins and disappearance of Pictishness stands as the best example of this phenomenon.

Dr Tom McNally, University of Aberdeen: **Support Networks for the Catholic Mission in the Lifetime of Thomas Innes:**

Despite successful missions in Scotland in the late 16th and 17th centuries run by the Jesuits and Irish Franciscans, secular priests were unable to coordinate a mission until they were able to construct a network capable of providing them with support equal to that enjoyed by the regular orders. The men who made up this network had been students together at the Scots College in Paris in the 1640s and each took on a vital role in support of the mission. William Ballentine became procurator of the mission based in Elgin while Robert Barclay, as principal of the Scots College in Paris, built a new enlarged college capable of training greater numbers of young men as missionaries. Key to the network, however, was William Leslie who represented the Scots secular mission in Rome and became an important figure in *Propaganda Fide*. He was able to ensure support – both financial and political - from the Roman authorities for the Scots. The network expanded substantially when Thomas Fleming became abbot of the Scots Benedictine abbey in Regensburg. He too had been a student at the Scots College in Paris and inspired by Barclay gave the mission the additional support of the Scots monks in Germany. The mission was able to survive and even achieve a degree of success despite suffering continued attacks from the British authorities and the Kirk.

The Innes Review

The next edition of *The Innes Review*, vol.63 no.2 is currently available and contains the following articles.

Cult and culture in a medieval community: Ayton & Coldingham, 1188-1367. (J. Donnelly).

Iona in 1771: Gaelic tradition and visitors' experiences. (Richard Sharpe).

Comforting sentences from the warming room at Inchcolm abbey. (John Reuben Davies, Richard Sharpe & Simon Taylor).

For subscription information, please visit the Edinburgh University Press website <http://www.euppublishing.com/journal/inr>

New Publications

In addition to *The Innes Review*, several articles and books have been published over the last 12 months or so which might be of interest to the SCHA membership:

The most recent edition of the journal of the Catholic Record Society, *Recusant History* vol.31 no.2 (Oct., 2012), focused on Scotland, and contains the following articles:

Tom McNally, '**Scholars & Spies: three Humanists in the service of James VI**'.

Jan Graffius, '**The Stuart Relics in the Stonyhurst Collection**'.

R. Scott Spurlock, '**Confessionalization & Clan Cohesion: Ireland's Contribution to Scottish Catholic Renewal in the Seventeenth Century**'.

Fern Insh, '**Recusants & the Rosary: a Seventeenth-Century Chapel in Aberdeen**'.

Mary Prior, '**John & Cosmo Alexander: of Recusancy, Jacobites and Aberdeen Junctures**'.

Shelagh Noden, '**The Revival of Music in the post-Reformation Catholic Church in Scotland**'.

Darren Tierney, '**John Carmont, the Mitchell Trust and Scottish Catholicism, 1865-1885**'.

S. Karly Kehoe, '**Accessing Empire: Irish Surgeons and the Royal Navy, 1850-1880**', *Social History of Medicine*.

Rosemary Hannah, **The Grand Designer: Third Marquess of Bute** (Edinburgh, 2012).

David McRoberts & Stephen M. Holmes, **Lost Interiors: the Furnishings of Scottish Churches in the Later Middle Ages** (Edinburgh, 2012).

SCHA Secretary: Dr. S. Karly Kehoe, Social Sciences, Media & Journalism, Glasgow Caledonian University, Cowcaddens Road, Glasgow, G4 0BA.

Membership Edinburgh University Press, 22 George Square, Edinburgh, EH8 9LF.